

# Forestry Civil Engineering (FCE) Head Office Review

## Record of Meeting held on 19<sup>th</sup> November 2009

Present: Frank MacCulloch (Chair)  
Gavin Queen  
Helen Paterson  
Julie McMorran  
Diana Hilliard  
Bruce Hamilton  
Andrew Stewart  
Mike Cowan

### 1. Introduction & Matters arising

Frank introduced the second meeting of the working group.

The group confirmed that they were content with the minutes of the last meeting and the terms of reference document. The group also confirmed that the actions points have been completed.

Frank acknowledged that he needs to include the FCE staff based in Stirling in the distribution list on communications relating to this review.

**Action: F MacCulloch**

Helen asked if the group could reschedule the third meeting planned. The revised meeting date was agreed as 15 December at 9am in Silvan House.

Helen confirmed that a risk assessment will be undertaken using the HSE management standards when the outcome of the review is known.

Andrew confirmed that he will check to see if Allan MacKenzie intends to have future involvement on the review working group.

**Action: A Stewart**

The group put forward that the energy efficiency of any proposed new office should be taken into account and Frank confirmed that he would look into the data that might be available for this purpose.

**Action: F MacCulloch**

### 2. Scoring Matrix

The group confirmed they were content with the format of the matrix and the methodology that will be used, i.e. criteria scored 1 (low) to 5 (high) including an indication of how low and high scores are defined for each criterion.

After some discussion on how scores will be defined, Helen proposed that rather than being a statistical model, the matrix is a transparent way of demonstrating how the group reached a decision. The group will collectively agree ratings through discussion on each location with regard to the criteria, paying attention to the high and low score benchmarks.

The group discussed each criterion and decided the following:

- to join the 'secure base' criterion with 'Staff Retention/Attraction', which will be moved higher up the matrix. All four criteria will have equal weighting.
- under the 'profile – visibility' criterion, to correspond with 'not readily available to senior staff' in the low score definition, the opposite will feature within the high score definition i.e. 'readily available to senior staff'
- under the 'customer service' criterion, mobile phone signal will apply within the definition
- under the 'suitable space' criterion, 'local amenities – ability to get food' will be added
- under the 'staff retention/attraction' criterion, 'office facilities' will be taken out as it is duplicated elsewhere in the matrix
- under the 'staff retention/attraction' criterion if 'pool for staff recruitment' becomes a deciding factor then the group could obtain recruitment data/statistics for assessment
- under the 'staff retention/attraction' criterion, 'opportunity for staff development' would remain
- under the 'staff retention/attraction' criterion, 'Good health, work-life balance' will be added

Frank confirmed that as well as environmental impact, the matrix will also incorporate a cost analysis **in accordance with agreed FC procedures**. Frank will return to the group with details of what will be considered for the monetary criteria.

**Action: F MacCulloch**

In terms of the 'customer service' criterion, Helen asked if there was value in getting feedback from customers for this review. The group recognised that both FCE and Forest District should be regarded as customers. Frank confirmed that he would approach the FCE Service Board for their feedback.

**Action: F MacCulloch**

Frank gave the group an opportunity to add further to the discussion on the matrix and the group were content that all matters had been dealt with. It was confirmed that before the next meeting the group could start to gather and consider information on the office location options: Peebles location; Silvan House; Tweekbank; and possibly another location yet to be identified within reasonable commute for affected staff. Diana confirmed that she would issue the group with details of a suitable office location available in Peebles.

**Action: D Hilliard**

Mike confirmed that he would send Frank a record of the meeting as soon as possible for issue.

**Action: M Cowan**